

Programming Language Concepts: Lecture 14

S P Suresh

Chennai Mathematical Institute

`spsuresh@cmi.ac.in`

<http://www.cmi.ac.in/~spsuresh/teaching/plc16>

March 16, 2016

λ -calculus: syntax

- Assume a countably infinite set Var of variables

λ -calculus: syntax

- Assume a countably infinite set Var of variables
- The set Λ of lambda expressions is given by

$$\Lambda = x \mid \lambda x.M \mid MN$$

where $x \in Var$ and $M, N \in \Lambda$.

λ -calculus: syntax

- Assume a countably infinite set Var of variables
- The set Λ of lambda expressions is given by

$$\Lambda = x \mid \lambda x.M \mid MN$$

where $x \in Var$ and $M, N \in \Lambda$.

- Basic rule for computation (rewriting) is called β -reduction (or contraction)

λ -calculus: syntax

- Assume a countably infinite set Var of variables
- The set Λ of lambda expressions is given by

$$\Lambda = x \mid \lambda x.M \mid MN$$

where $x \in Var$ and $M, N \in \Lambda$.

- Basic rule for computation (rewriting) is called β -reduction (or contraction)
 - $(\lambda x.M)N \longrightarrow_{\beta} M[x := N]$

λ -calculus: syntax

- Assume a countably infinite set Var of variables
- The set Λ of lambda expressions is given by

$$\Lambda = x \mid \lambda x.M \mid MN$$

where $x \in Var$ and $M, N \in \Lambda$.

- Basic rule for computation (rewriting) is called β -reduction (or contraction)
 - $(\lambda x.M)N \longrightarrow_{\beta} M[x := N]$
 - $M[x := N]$: substitute free occurrences of x in M by N

λ -calculus: syntax

- Assume a countably infinite set Var of variables
- The set Λ of lambda expressions is given by

$$\Lambda = x \mid \lambda x.M \mid MN$$

where $x \in Var$ and $M, N \in \Lambda$.

- Basic rule for computation (rewriting) is called β -reduction (or contraction)
 - $(\lambda x.M)N \longrightarrow_{\beta} M[x := N]$
 - $M[x := N]$: substitute free occurrences of x in M by N
- We rename the bound variables in M to avoid “capturing” free variables of N in M

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$
 - $f^{n+1} x = f(f^n x)$

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$
 - $f^{n+1} x = f(f^n x)$
 - Thus $f^n x = f(f(\dots(f x) \dots))$, where f is applied repeatedly n times

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$
 - $f^{n+1} x = f(f^n x)$
 - Thus $f^n x = f(f(\dots(f x) \dots))$, where f is applied repeatedly n times
- For instance

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$
 - $f^{n+1} x = f(f^n x)$
 - Thus $f^n x = f(f(\dots(f x) \dots))$, where f is applied repeatedly n times
- For instance
 - $[0] = \lambda f x. x$

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$
 - $f^{n+1} x = f(f^n x)$
 - Thus $f^n x = f(f(\dots(f x) \dots))$, where f is applied repeatedly n times
- For instance
 - $[0] = \lambda f x. x$
 - $[1] = \lambda f x. f x$

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$
 - $f^{n+1} x = f(f^n x)$
 - Thus $f^n x = f(f(\dots(f x) \dots))$, where f is applied repeatedly n times
- For instance
 - $[0] = \lambda f x. x$
 - $[1] = \lambda f x. f x$
 - $[2] = \lambda f x. f(f x)$

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$
 - $f^{n+1} x = f(f^n x)$
 - Thus $f^n x = f(f(\dots(f x)\dots))$, where f is applied repeatedly n times
- For instance
 - $[0] = \lambda f x. x$
 - $[1] = \lambda f x. f x$
 - $[2] = \lambda f x. f(f x)$
 - $[3] = \lambda f x. f(f(f x))$

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$
 - $f^{n+1} x = f(f^n x)$
 - Thus $f^n x = f(f(\dots(f x) \dots))$, where f is applied repeatedly n times
- For instance
 - $[0] = \lambda f x. x$
 - $[1] = \lambda f x. f x$
 - $[2] = \lambda f x. f(f x)$
 - $[3] = \lambda f x. f(f(f x))$
 - ...

Church numerals

- $[n] = \lambda f x. f^n x$
 - $f^0 x = x$
 - $f^{n+1} x = f(f^n x)$
 - Thus $f^n x = f(f(\dots(f x) \dots))$, where f is applied repeatedly n times
- For instance
 - $[0] = \lambda f x. x$
 - $[1] = \lambda f x. f x$
 - $[2] = \lambda f x. f(f x)$
 - $[3] = \lambda f x. f(f(f x))$
 - ...
- $[n] g y = (\lambda f x. f(\dots(f x) \dots)) g y \xrightarrow{*} \beta g(\dots(g y) \dots) = g^n y$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- Successor function: $\text{succ}(n) = n + 1$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- Successor function: $\text{succ}(n) = n + 1$
- $[\text{succ}] = \lambda p f x. f(p f x)$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- Successor function: $\text{succ}(n) = n + 1$
- $[\text{succ}] = \lambda p f x. f(p f x)$
- For all n , $[\text{succ}][n] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [n + 1]$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Successor function:** $\text{succ}(n) = n + 1$
- $[\text{succ}] = \lambda p f x. f(p f x)$
- For all n , $[\text{succ}][n] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [n + 1]$
 - $[\text{succ}][n]$
$$\begin{aligned} (\lambda p f x. f(p f x))[n] &\xrightarrow{\beta} \lambda f x. f([n] f x) \\ &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} \lambda f x. f(f^n x) \\ &= \lambda f x. f^{n+1} x \\ &= [n + 1] \end{aligned}$$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- Addition: $plus(m, n) = m + n$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Addition:** $plus(m, n) = m + n$
- $[plus] = \lambda p q f x. p f (q f x)$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Addition:** $plus(m, n) = m + n$
- $[plus] = \lambda p q f x. p f (q f x)$
- For all m and n , $[plus][m + n] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [m + n]$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Addition:** $plus(m, n) = m + n$
- $[plus] = \lambda p q f x. p f (q f x)$
- For all m and n , $[plus][m + n] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [m + n]$

$$\begin{aligned}
 & \bullet [plus][m][n] \\
 & \quad (\lambda p q f x. p f (q f x))[m][n] \xrightarrow{\beta} \lambda q f x. [m] f (q f x) \\
 & \quad \xrightarrow{\beta} \lambda f x. [m] f ([n] f x) \\
 & \quad \xrightarrow[*]{\beta} \lambda f x. f^m([n] f x) \\
 & \quad \xrightarrow[*]{\beta} \lambda f x. f^m(f^n x) \\
 & \quad = \lambda f x. f^{m+n} x \\
 & \quad = [m + n]
 \end{aligned}$$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- Multiplication: $\text{mult}(m, n) = mn$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- Multiplication: $mult(m, n) = mn$
- $[mult] = \lambda p q f x. p(qf)x$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Multiplication:** $mult(m, n) = mn$
- $[mult] = \lambda p q f x. p(qf)x$
- For all $m \geq 0$, $([n]f)^m x \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} f^{mn} x$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Multiplication:** $mult(m, n) = mn$
- $[mult] = \lambda p q f x. p(qf)x$
- For all $m \geq 0$, $([n]f)^m x \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} f^{mn} x$
 - $([n]f)^0 x = x = f^{0 \cdot n} x$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Multiplication:** $mult(m, n) = mn$
- $[mult] = \lambda p q f x. p(qf)x$
- For all $m \geq 0$, $([n]f)^m x \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} f^{mn} x$
 - $([n]f)^0 x = x = f^{0 \cdot n} x$
 - $$\begin{aligned} ([n]f)^{m+1} x &= ([n]f)([n]f)^m x \\ &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [n]f(f^{mn} x) \\ &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} f^m(f^{mn} x) = f^{mn+m} x = f^{(m+1)n} x \end{aligned}$$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Multiplication:** $mult(m, n) = mn$
- $[mult] = \lambda p q f x. p(qf)x$
- For all $m \geq 0$, $([n]f)^m x \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} f^{mn} x$
 - $([n]f)^0 x = x = f^{0 \cdot n} x$
 - $$\begin{aligned} ([n]f)^{m+1} x &= ([n]f)([n]f)^m x \\ &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [n]f(f^{mn} x) \\ &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} f^n(f^{mn} x) = f^{mn+n} x = f^{(m+1)n} x \end{aligned}$$
- For all m and n , $[mult][m][n] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [mn]$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Multiplication:** $mult(m, n) = mn$
- $[mult] = \lambda p q f x. p(qf)x$
- For all $m \geq 0$, $([n]f)^m x \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} f^{mn} x$
 - $([n]f)^0 x = x = f^{0 \cdot n} x$
 - $$\begin{aligned} ([n]f)^{m+1} x &= ([n]f)([n]f)^m x \\ &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [n]f(f^{mn} x) \\ &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} f^n(f^{mn} x) = f^{mn+n} x = f^{(m+1)n} x \end{aligned}$$
- For all m and n , $[mult][m][n] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [mn]$
 - $$\begin{aligned} (\lambda p q f x. p(qf)x)[m][n] &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} \lambda f x. [m]([n]f)x \\ &= \lambda f x. (\lambda g y. g^m y)([n]f)x \\ &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} \lambda f x. ([n]f)^m x \\ &\xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} \lambda f x. f^{mn} x = [mn] \end{aligned}$$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- Exponentiation: $\text{exp}(m, n) = m^n$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- Exponentiation: $\text{exp}(m, n) = m^n$
 - $\text{exp}(0, 0)$ is taken to be 1

Encoding arithmetic functions

- Exponentiation: $\text{exp}(m, n) = m^n$
 - $\text{exp}(0, 0)$ is taken to be 1
- $[\text{exp}] = \lambda p q f x. q p f x$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Exponentiation:** $\text{exp}(m, n) = m^n$
 - $\text{exp}(0, 0)$ is taken to be 1
- $[\text{exp}] = \lambda p q f x. q p f x$
- For all m and n , $[\text{exp}][m][n] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [m^n]$

Encoding arithmetic functions

- **Exponentiation:** $\text{exp}(m, n) = m^n$
 - $\text{exp}(0, 0)$ is taken to be 1
- $[\text{exp}] = \lambda p q f x. q p f x$
- For all m and n , $[\text{exp}][m][n] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [m^n]$
 - **Proof:** Exercise!

Computability

- Church numerals encode $n \in \mathbb{N}$

Computability

- Church numerals encode $n \in \mathbb{N}$
- Can we encode computable functions $f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$?

Computability

- Church numerals encode $n \in \mathbb{N}$
- Can we encode computable functions $f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$?
 - Let $[f]$ be the encoding of f

Computability

- Church numerals encode $n \in \mathbb{N}$
- Can we encode computable functions $f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$?
 - Let $[f]$ be the encoding of f
 - We want $[f][n_1] \cdots [n_k] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [f(n_1, \dots, n_k)]$

Computability

- Church numerals encode $n \in \mathbb{N}$
- Can we encode computable functions $f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$?
 - Let $[f]$ be the encoding of f
 - We want $[f][n_1] \cdots [n_k] \xrightarrow{*}_{\beta} [f(n_1, \dots, n_k)]$
- We need a syntax for computable functions

Recursive functions

- Recursive functions [[Dedekind](#), [Skolem](#), [Gödel](#), [Kleene](#)]

Recursive functions

- Recursive functions [[Dedekind](#), [Skolem](#), [Gödel](#), [Kleene](#)]
 - Equivalent to Turing machines

Recursive functions

- Recursive functions [Dedekind, Skolem, Gödel, Kleene]
 - Equivalent to Turing machines

Definition

$f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is obtained by composition from $g : \mathbb{N}^\ell \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ and $h_1, \dots, h_\ell : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ if

$$f(\vec{n}) = g(h_1(\vec{n}), \dots, h_\ell(\vec{n}))$$

Recursive functions

- Recursive functions [Dedekind, Skolem, Gödel, Kleene]
 - Equivalent to Turing machines

Definition

$f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is obtained by composition from $g : \mathbb{N}^\ell \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ and $h_1, \dots, h_\ell : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ if

$$f(\vec{n}) = g(h_1(\vec{n}), \dots, h_\ell(\vec{n}))$$

- Notation: $f = g \circ (h_1, h_2, \dots, h_\ell)$

Recursive functions

Definition

$f : \mathbb{N}^{k+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is obtained by **primitive recursion** from $g : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ and $h : \mathbb{N}^{k+2} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ if

$$\begin{aligned} f(0, \vec{n}) &= g(\vec{n}) \\ f(n+1, \vec{n}) &= h(n, f(n, \vec{n}), \vec{n}) \end{aligned}$$

Recursive functions

Definition

$f : \mathbb{N}^{k+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is obtained by **primitive recursion** from $g : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ and $h : \mathbb{N}^{k+2} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ if

$$\begin{aligned} f(0, \vec{n}) &= g(\vec{n}) \\ f(n+1, \vec{n}) &= h(n, f(n, \vec{n}), \vec{n}) \end{aligned}$$

- Equivalent to computing a **for** loop:

```
result = g(n1, ..., nk);    // f(0, n1, ..., nk)
for (i = 0; i < n; i++) {   // computing f(i+1, n1, ..., nk)
    result = h(i, result, n1, ..., nk);
}
return result;
```

Recursive functions

Definition

$f : \mathbb{N}^{k+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is obtained by **primitive recursion** from $g : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ and $h : \mathbb{N}^{k+2} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ if

$$\begin{aligned} f(0, \vec{n}) &= g(\vec{n}) \\ f(n+1, \vec{n}) &= h(n, f(n, \vec{n}), \vec{n}) \end{aligned}$$

- Equivalent to computing a **for** loop:

```
result = g(n1, ..., nk);      // f(0, n1, ..., nk)
for (i = 0; i < n; i++) {    // computing f(i+1, n1, ..., nk)
    result = h(i, result, n1, ..., nk);
}
return result;
```

- **Note** If g and h are total functions, so is f

Recursive functions

Definition

$f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is obtained by μ -recursion or minimization from $g : \mathbb{N}^{k+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ if

$$f(\vec{n}) = \begin{cases} n & \text{if } g(n, \vec{n}) = 0 \text{ and } \forall m < n : g(m, \vec{n}) > 0 \\ \text{undefined} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Notation: $f(\vec{n}) = \mu n (g(n, \vec{n}) = 0)$

Recursive functions

Definition

$f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is obtained by μ -recursion or minimization from $g : \mathbb{N}^{k+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ if

$$f(\vec{n}) = \begin{cases} n & \text{if } g(n, \vec{n}) = 0 \text{ and } \forall m < n : g(m, \vec{n}) > 0 \\ \text{undefined} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Notation: $f(\vec{n}) = \mu n (g(n, \vec{n}) = 0)$

- Equivalent to computing a **while** loop:

```
n = 0;  
while (g(n, n1, ..., nk) > 0) {n = n + 1;}  
return n;
```

Recursive functions

Definition

$f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is obtained by μ -recursion or minimization from $g : \mathbb{N}^{k+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ if

$$f(\vec{n}) = \begin{cases} n & \text{if } g(n, \vec{n}) = 0 \text{ and } \forall m < n : g(m, \vec{n}) > 0 \\ \text{undefined} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Notation: $f(\vec{n}) = \mu n (g(n, \vec{n}) = 0)$

- Equivalent to computing a **while** loop:

```
n = 0;  
while (g(n, n1, ..., nk) > 0) {n = n + 1;}  
return n;
```

- f need not be total even if g is

Recursive functions

Definition

$f : \mathbb{N}^k \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ is obtained by μ -recursion or minimization from $g : \mathbb{N}^{k+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ if

$$f(\vec{n}) = \begin{cases} n & \text{if } g(n, \vec{n}) = 0 \text{ and } \forall m < n : g(m, \vec{n}) > 0 \\ \text{undefined} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Notation: $f(\vec{n}) = \mu n (g(n, \vec{n}) = 0)$

- Equivalent to computing a **while** loop:

```
n = 0;  
while (g(n, n1, ..., nk) > 0) {n = n + 1;}  
return n;
```

- f need not be total even if g is
- If $f(\vec{n}) = n$, then $g(m, \vec{n})$ is defined for all $m \leq n$

Recursive functions

Definition

The class of **primitive recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

Recursive functions

Definition

The class of **primitive recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- ① containing the **initial functions**

Recursive functions

Definition

The class of **primitive recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- ① containing the **initial functions**

$$\text{Zero } Z(n) = 0$$

Recursive functions

Definition

The class of **primitive recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- ① containing the **initial functions**

Zero $Z(n) = 0$

Successor $S(n) = n + 1$

Recursive functions

Definition

The class of **primitive recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- I containing the **initial functions**

Zero $Z(n) = 0$

Successor $S(n) = n + 1$

Projection $\Pi_i^k(n_1, \dots, n_k) = n_i$

Recursive functions

Definition

The class of **primitive recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- 1 containing the **initial functions**

Zero $Z(n) = 0$

Successor $S(n) = n + 1$

Projection $\Pi_i^k(n_1, \dots, n_k) = n_i$

- 2 closed under composition and primitive recursion

Recursive functions

Definition

The class of **primitive recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- 1 containing the **initial functions**

Zero $Z(n) = 0$

Successor $S(n) = n + 1$

Projection $\Pi_i^k(n_1, \dots, n_k) = n_i$

- 2 closed under composition and primitive recursion

Definition

The class of **(partial) recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

Recursive functions

Definition

The class of **primitive recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- 1 containing the **initial functions**

Zero $Z(n) = 0$

Successor $S(n) = n + 1$

Projection $\Pi_i^k(n_1, \dots, n_k) = n_i$

- 2 closed under composition and primitive recursion

Definition

The class of **(partial) recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- 1 containing the initial functions

Recursive functions

Definition

The class of **primitive recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- 1 containing the **initial functions**

Zero $Z(n) = 0$

Successor $S(n) = n + 1$

Projection $\Pi_i^k(n_1, \dots, n_k) = n_i$

- 2 closed under composition and primitive recursion

Definition

The class of **(partial) recursive functions** is the smallest class of functions

- 1 containing the initial functions
- 2 closed under composition, primitive recursion and minimization

Recursive functions: Examples

- $f(n) = n + 2$ is $S \circ S$

Recursive functions: Examples

- $f(n) = n + 2$ is $S \circ S$
- $plus(n, m) = n + m$ is got by primitive recursion from $g = \Pi_1^1$ and $h = S \circ \Pi_2^3$

$$\begin{aligned} plus(0, m) &= g(m) &= \Pi_1^1(m) \\ & &= m \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} plus(n+1, m) &= h(n, plus(n, m), m) \\ &= S \circ \Pi_2^3(n, plus(n, m), m) = S(plus(n, m)) \end{aligned}$$

Recursive functions: Examples

- $mult(n, m) = nm$ is got by primitive recursion from $g = Z$ and $h = plus \circ (\Pi_2^3, \Pi_3^3)$

$$\begin{aligned} mult(0, m) &= g(m) &= Z(m) \\ & &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} mult(n+1, m) &= h(n, plus(n, m), m) \\ &= plus \circ (\Pi_2^3, \Pi_3^3)(n, mult(n, m), m) \\ &= nm + m \\ &= (n+1)m \end{aligned}$$

Recursive functions: Examples

- $mult(n, m) = nm$ is got by primitive recursion from $g = Z$ and $h = plus \circ (\Pi_2^3, \Pi_3^3)$

$$\begin{aligned} mult(0, m) &= g(m) &&= Z(m) \\ &&&= 0 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} mult(n+1, m) &= h(n, plus(n, m), m) \\ &= plus \circ (\Pi_2^3, \Pi_3^3)(n, mult(n, m), m) \\ &= nm + m \\ &= (n+1)m \end{aligned}$$

- $f(m) = \log_2 m$ is defined by minimization from $g(n, m) = m - 2^n$

Recursive functions: Examples

- $mult(n, m) = nm$ is got by primitive recursion from $g = Z$ and $h = plus \circ (\Pi_2^3, \Pi_3^3)$

$$\begin{aligned} mult(0, m) &= g(m) &= Z(m) \\ & &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} mult(n+1, m) &= h(n, plus(n, m), m) \\ &= plus \circ (\Pi_2^3, \Pi_3^3)(n, mult(n, m), m) \\ &= nm + m \\ &= (n+1)m \end{aligned}$$

- $f(m) = \log_2 m$ is defined by minimization from $g(n, m) = m - 2^n$
 - First n such that $m - 2^n = 0$ is $\log_2 m$

Recursive functions: Examples

- $mult(n, m) = nm$ is got by primitive recursion from $g = Z$ and $h = plus \circ (\Pi_2^3, \Pi_3^3)$

$$\begin{aligned} mult(0, m) &= g(m) &= Z(m) \\ & &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} mult(n+1, m) &= h(n, plus(n, m), m) \\ &= plus \circ (\Pi_2^3, \Pi_3^3)(n, mult(n, m), m) \\ &= nm + m \\ &= (n+1)m \end{aligned}$$

- $f(m) = \log_2 m$ is defined by minimization from $g(n, m) = m - 2^n$
 - First n such that $m - 2^n = 0$ is $\log_2 m$
 - Not defined for all m !